

JOHN COOPER, MAYOR

DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE

**METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY**

9/24/2020 | 8:24 AM CDT

Mr. Chad Collier
Collier Engineering Co., Inc.
2949 Nolensville Pike
Nashville, TN 37211

Re: **RFQ# 57096, Paving Program Management Services**

Dear Mr. Collier:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 57096 - Paving Program Management Services. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to **Collier Engineering Co., Inc.**, contingent upon successful contract negotiations. Please provide a certificate of Insurance indicating all applicable coverages within 15 business days of the receipt of this letter.

If the Equal Business Opportunity (EBO) Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification.

Additionally, the awardee will be required to submit evidence of participation of and contractor's payment to all Small, Minority, and Women Owned Businesses participation in any resultant contract. This evidence shall be submitted monthly and include copies of subcontracts or purchase orders, the Prime Contractor's Application for Payment, or invoices, and cancelled checks or other supporting payment documents. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact **Christopher Wood**, BAO Representative, at **615-862-6710** or at **Christopher.Wood@nashville.gov**.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Buyer, **Terri Ray**, by email at **Terri.Ray@nashville.gov** Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File, Other Offerors

Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

A. Right to Protest. Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

Procurement Division

730 Second Avenue South, Suite 112
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

www.Nashville.gov
Phone: 615-862-6180
Fax: 615-862-6179

**RFQ 57096 – PAVING PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SERVICES
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Evaluation Criteria/Officer	Collier Engineering Co., Inc.	Gresham Smith	Smith Seckman Reid, Inc.	TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.	TTL, Inc
Management Plan and Approach (30 points)	27.50	24.00	28.00	15.00	27.25
Team Structure, Qualifications, and Capacity (35 points)	32.25	32.00	31.75	19.75	31.75
Relevant Project Experience (35 points)	32.00	31.25	29.50	18.00	26.25
Total (100 points)	91.75	87.25	89.25	52.75	85.25

Collier Engineering Co., Inc.

Strengths – Proposal demonstrated in-depth experience of projects of similar size, scope, and complexity, including grant recovery and pavement preservation experience. Proposal demonstrated experience working with sixty-six different contractors. Proposed team structure demonstrated extensive experience of similar size, scope, and complexity. Proposal included a GIS specialist. Proposal dedicated an individual for 20% sidewalk portion of the program. Proposal demonstrated the use of drones on projects.

Weaknesses – Proposal demonstrated a high anticipated percentage of dedication for senior staff compared to other offerors. Proposal demonstrated limited team structure experience on projects of similar size, scope, and complexity outside of Metro projects. Proposal lacked resumes of a proposed subcontractor. Management plan and approach portion of proposal included duplicated information previously provided as the response to relevant project experience. Proposal demonstrated a lack of information related to public outreach.

Gresham Smith

Strengths – Proposal demonstrated small city project experience. Proposal demonstrated experience working with eighteen different contractors. Diverse experience of proposed team structure. Proposal demonstrated cost saving strategy. Proposed the use of ADA checklist software. Proposal demonstrated an understanding of the impact of Vision Zero.

Weaknesses – Proposal failed to demonstrate paving program management experience, including pavement preservation experience. Proposal failed to demonstrate an individual for GIS and data mitigation. Proposed monthly project status meetings, which is not reasonable for Metro's paving program. Proposed to strive to monitor a 20% population of projects for ADA

**RFQ 57096 – PAVING PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SERVICES
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Evaluation Criteria/Officer	Collier Engineering Co., Inc.	Gresham Smith	Smith Seckman Reid, Inc.	TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.	TTL, Inc
Management Plan and Approach (30 points)	27.50	24.00	28.00	15.00	27.25
Team Structure, Qualifications, and Capacity (35 points)	32.25	32.00	31.75	19.75	31.75
Relevant Project Experience (35 points)	32.00	31.25	29.50	18.00	26.25
Total (100 points)	91.75	87.25	89.25	52.75	85.25

compliance rather than making sure the full population is monitored. Proposal demonstrated an overenforcement of QA/QC in approach.

Smith Seckman Reid, Inc

Strengths – Proposal demonstrated experience working with twenty-four different contractors. Proposal demonstrated 50% program management dedication anticipated. Proposal demonstrated a social distancing approach given the COVID-19 pandemic by utilizing contactless ticketing process. Proposal demonstrated detailed, innovative and progressive approaches, including less milling. Proposal promoted the use of Cartegraph and a sidewalk repair application tool.

Weaknesses – Proposed relevant project experience was project management focused rather than program management focused. Proposal included relevant project experience that was outside of the requested timeframe. Proposal failed to demonstrate an individual for GIS and data mitigation.

TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.

Strengths – Proposal demonstrated relevant experience for proposed staff members.

Weaknesses – Proposal failed to demonstrate experience of similar size, scope, and complexity. Proposal demonstrated that individual staff had limited experience, however, firm does not have paving program management experience. Proposal demonstrated vertical construction experience. Proposal failed to demonstrate a response to several evaluation criteria items such as litigation and financial strength. Proposal failed to provide experience on State Aid or FEMA related projects. Proposal demonstrated more relevant project experience with heavy vertical construction versus pavement management in response to the evaluation criteria. Team structure proposal was mostly made up of relevant project experience responses. The proposal's

**RFQ 57096 – PAVING PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SERVICES
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Evaluation Criteria/Officer	Collier Engineering Co., Inc.	Gresham Smith	Smith Seckman Reid, Inc.	TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.	TTL, Inc
Management Plan and Approach (30 points)	27.50	24.00	28.00	15.00	27.25
Team Structure, Qualifications, and Capacity (35 points)	32.25	32.00	31.75	19.75	31.75
Relevant Project Experience (35 points)	32.00	31.25	29.50	18.00	26.25
Total (100 points)	91.75	87.25	89.25	52.75	85.25

team structure focused more heavily on elements of structural engineering and its principal as a structural engineer, but not on the team's strength in pavement management. Proposal demonstrated limited experience with Metro. Management Plan and Approach was basically a copy and paste of the scope of the solicitation. Failed to address several items requested.

TTL, Inc.

Strengths – Proposal demonstrated a variety of relevant project experience of similar scope and complexity specifically related to pavement and construction, engineering, inspection (CEI) services. Proposed team structure demonstrated the inclusion a traffic engineer, GIS specialist, and lighting specialist. Management plan and approach identified challenges such as unknown subgrade.

Weaknesses – Proposal lacked the demonstration of smaller and local size project experience. Proposal demonstrated an email communication approach for documentation. Proposal lacked detail related to cost saving methods.

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet**BAO Specialist: Christopher S. Wood****Contract Specialist: Terri Ray****Date: 06/11/2020****Department Name: Public Works****RFP/ITB Number: 57096****Project Name: Pavement Program Management Services****SBE/SDV
Requirement
Acknowledged?****Primary Contractor****Comments**

Collier Engineering Co. Inc,

Yes

Proposer acknowledged the 10% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms: GeoTek, Varallo Public Relations, CNT Enterprises and NuOrigins

Gresham Smith

Yes

Proposer acknowledged the 10% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms: GeoTek Engineering, Varallo Public Relations, and KS Ware and Associates

Smith Seckman Reid Inc.

Yes

Proposer acknowledged the 10% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms: GeoTek, Civil Infrastructure and Morgan and Morgan, Inc.

TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.

Yes

Proposer acknowledged the 10% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms: GeoTek Engineering

TTL, Inc.

Yes

Proposer acknowledged the 10% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms: BEAC, Win Engineering, Morgan and Morgan, Inc., LI Smith & Associates, Entrée Savvy.

EBO Compliance Results Form

Department Name: Public Works

RFP/ITB Number: 57096

Paving Program Management Services

Primary Contractor	Acknowledged Established EBO Goals (Yes/No)	Determination Comments of Participation Proposed or Bid
Collier Engineering Co. Inc.*	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program. They acknowledge M/WBE goals and that they can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of GeoTek (MBE) and NuOrigin (MBE). They also proposed the engagement of HQ Direct (WBE), Varallo Public Relations (WBE) and Ram Tool Company (WBE). After my initial review two companies listed as WBE are MBE and the other HQ Direct wasn't registered with Metro.
Gresham Smith*	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program. They acknowledged M/WBE goals and that they can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the MBE of GeoTek and the WBE engagement of KS Ware & Associates and Varallo Public Relations. After my initial review the listed WBE firms are MBE.
Smith Seckman Reid Inc.*	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program having acknowledge M/WBE goals and can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the MBE engagement GeoTek and Morgan and Morgan, Inc. Proposed the WBE engagement of Civic Engineering. After my initial review Morgan and Morgan, Inc. (MBE) certification has expired and Civic Engineering (WBE) is an MBE.
TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.*	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program. They acknowledged M/WBE goals and that they can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the MBE engagement of GeoTek and WBE engagement of KS Ware & Associates, Civil Infrastructure, and Connico. After my initial review KS Ware & Associates and Connico are MBE
TTL, Inc.*	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program. They acknowledged M/WBE goals and that they can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the MBE engagement of Morgan and Morgan, Inc. and the WBE engagement of BEAC PC, Win Engineering, and Water and Erosion Control of TN. After my initial review BEAC (WBE) is an MBE with an expired certification, Water Erosion of TN (WBE) is pending approval with Metro and Morgan and Morgan Inc. (MBE) certification is expired.

*Denotes follow-up required

Date: 6/11/2020

Metro Buyer: Terri Ray

BAO Rep: Christopher S. Wood

Certificate Of Completion

Envelope Id: C0D4B5A49F42483DB0085745B155AE2D

Status: Completed

Subject: Intent to Award - RFQ #57096 Paving Program Management Serv.

Source Envelope:

Document Pages: 6

Signatures: 1

Envelope Originator:

Certificate Pages: 2

Initials: 0

Procurement Resource Group

AutoNav: Enabled

730 2nd Ave. South 1st Floor

Envelopeld Stamping: Enabled

Nashville, TN 37219

Time Zone: (UTC-06:00) Central Time (US & Canada)

prg@nashville.gov

IP Address: 170.190.198.185

Record Tracking

Status: Original

Holder: Procurement Resource Group

Location: DocuSign

9/23/2020 2:59:58 PM

prg@nashville.gov

Signer Events

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane

michelle.lane@nashville.gov

Chief Procurement Officer/Purchasing Agent
Metro

Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

Signature

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane

Signature Adoption: Pre-selected Style

Using IP Address: 99.203.97.128

Signed using mobile

Timestamp

Sent: 9/23/2020 3:06:03 PM

Viewed: 9/23/2020 8:40:26 PM

Signed: 9/24/2020 8:24:13 AM

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:

Not Offered via DocuSign

In Person Signer Events

Signature

Timestamp

Editor Delivery Events

Status

Timestamp

Agent Delivery Events

Status

Timestamp

Intermediary Delivery Events

Status

Timestamp

Certified Delivery Events

Status

Timestamp

Carbon Copy Events

Status

Timestamp

Terri L. Ray

Terri.Ray@nashville.gov

Senior Procurement Officer

Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson

County

Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

COPIED

Sent: 9/24/2020 8:24:14 AM

Viewed: 9/24/2020 5:52:00 PM

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:

Not Offered via DocuSign

Witness Events

Signature

Timestamp

Notary Events

Signature

Timestamp

Envelope Summary Events

Status

Timestamps

Envelope Sent

Hashed/Encrypted

9/24/2020 8:24:14 AM

Certified Delivered

Security Checked

9/24/2020 8:24:14 AM

Signing Complete

Security Checked

9/24/2020 8:24:14 AM

Envelope Summary Events	Status	Timestamps
Completed	Security Checked	9/24/2020 8:24:14 AM
Payment Events	Status	Timestamps